Finding Lost attractiveness of the city
寻找“拆”掉的城市吸引力

——Cases Study on the Recent Urban Constructions and Demolitions Projects in Wuhan

WANG Xuan 王璇 华中科技大学
2010.6.20 同济大学
Contents

1. Source of “demolition”
2. Importance and origin of the city attractiveness
3. Influence of "demolition" on a city’s attractiveness
4. Preservation under the conflict
5. Cases study in Wuhan
Chapter 1

1. Source of “demolition”
2. Importance and origin of the city attractiveness
3. Influence of "demolition" on a city’s attractiveness
4. Preservation under the conflict
5. Cases study in Wuhan
1 Source of “demolition”

1.1 External source of demolition
- inadequate attention to the protection;
- the blind pursuit of short-term interest;
- lack of the patience for the key decision-making links;
- people has ignored the historical and cultural relics on a city's influence and its importance;
- rapid economic expansion has led to the cultural dislocation.

1.2 Internal source of demolition
- Blind renewal and reluctance of the human beings;
- Human are constantly replacing. Knocking those buildings down is absolutely simple but stupid, there will be no problem if the noumenon is lost.
Chapter 2

1. Source of “demolition”
2. Importance and origin of the city attractiveness
3. Influence of "demolition" on a city’s attractiveness
4. Preservation under the conflict
5. Cases study in Wuhan
2 Importance and origin of the city attractiveness

2.1 City’s Attractions determine its competitive edge

- Implementation of the cultural policy and preservation of the urban heritage make Barcelona and Liverpool (2008 European Capital of Culture) turn to the world-class cultural capitals.

Barcelona                       Liverpool
2.2 Lacking the cultural attractions is the root for the recession of Wuhan’s competitiveness

- Wuhan, "East Chicago" in the world, was a once glorious city. This title now can not be afforded now.
- In the game between the actual needs and the old buildings & streets preservation which can reflect the historical characteristics, the latter often are not the winner.
For the present Wuhan, urban economic base is not able to keep up with the urban development, creating a vicious circle; we should improve the former links to stimulate the economy.

- No extra capital for historic preservation, landscaping and culture construction
- Unable to improve its appearance effectively
- Unable to attract more tourists
- Lacking of attraction, talents and investments
- Economy will hardly grow rapidly
Chapter 3

1. Source of “demolition”
2. Importance and origin of the city attractiveness
3. Influence of "demolition" on a city’s attractiveness
4. Preservation under the conflict
5. Cases study in Wuhan
3 Influence of "demolition" on a city’s attractiveness

"Demolish" the historical relics is equivalent to "demolish" a city's culture and its history. Weakening of a city’s culture and history will weaken its attraction. In the short term, removal of the old buildings to build the new commercial or public facilities, absolutely, would obtain the immediate benefits.

- From the view of landscape, disfeature the townscape makes the city’s features become superficial, lacking of connotation and sediments of culture.
- From the history and culture point of view, it makes the culture carrier and history confirms lost, resulting in the cultural dislocation.
- From the environmental psychology point of view, the public's sense of belonging and the city's historical memory are losing.
- From the city management point of view, the forced demolishing is not conducive to the city's long-term stability.
- From urban development point of view, it will weaken the long-term driving force and attractiveness.

However, demolishment will make the city lose its long-term attraction.
Chapter 4

1. Source of "demolition"
2. Importance and origin of the city's attractiveness
3. Influence of "demolition" on a city's attractiveness
4. Preservation under the conflict
5. Cases study in Wuhan
4 Preservation under the conflict

--- finding the balance between non-material needs and actual demand

In development of a city, there are 2 main demands:

- **non-material needs**---Landscape and cultural values (Historic preservation)

- **actual demands**--- commercial development, transportation and infrastructure

- Historic preservation in non-material needs is a long-term protection; it is difficult to obtain short-term benefits.

- However, the actual demands pursue the investment benefits and return efficiency. **Conflict must exist between them.**
Preservation under the conflict

- How to coordinate such a conflict and find a balance between them?
- How to optimize the existing resources to enhance the attractiveness?

It is the primary task for present Wuhan.
Firstly, development in preservation and preservation in development shall be realized, with the clear boundary between them. No any redevelopment shall be done in the protected areas.

Secondly, Cherishing the existing unique historical and cultural treasure as well as natural resources in Wuhan, scenic spot facilities, history and culture protection construction, tourism, transport facilities, etc shall be established.

In today's competitive atmosphere, non-material needs have become increasingly essential due to its function in identification and updating tool for a city.
Chapter 5

1. Source of “demolition”
2. Importance and origin of the city attractiveness
3. Influence of "demolition" on a city’s attractiveness
4. Preservation under the conflict
5. Cases study in Wuhan
Cases study in Wuhan

5 Preservation strategy under “demolition” ——analysis on certain cases in Wuhan

- **Case 1:** Hangzheng Street
- **Case 2:** Comparison between Jiji Dawang Temple Power Plant and Baltimore Power Plant
- **Case 3:** metro station on Jianghan Road
5.1 Protection of the historic region: remain the historic noumenon and carry out the protection planning - the death and life of the old Hanzheng Street

- As the originator of the small commodities market nationally, Hanzheng Street was involved in the new demolition and rebuilding at the beginning of 2004.
- The lanes and alleys here being full of the living appeal will be replaced by the same lifeless buildings, and the past lifestyle and features of Hanzheng Street will be extinct.
Case 1: Hangzheng Street

- Hanzheng street district was the origin place of the old Hankou city
Case 1: Hangzheng Street

- The alleys and streets evolution since more than 100 years ago
Case1: Hangzheng Street

- **policies and suggestions as follows:**
  - **Strictly set the protection limit, any new development or that in name of protection will be forbidden;**
    第一、严格划定保护界限，对保护界限以内的严禁新的开发以及借保护名义的开发；
  - **For the areas beyond the compulsory protection limit, the important space segments in the past shall be left as far as possible, to combine with the new ones;**
    第二、对于强制保护界限以外的地区，应尽可能地保存以往的重要空间片段，进行新旧整合。
  - **The old alleys, lanes and pitching should be kept untouched, and the old buildings can be renovated internally, the new ones can be merged together adopting historical elements.**
    第三、老弄堂、街巷、铺地石等都应完整无缺的保留下来，老建筑可以进行内部修缮更新，新建筑应采用历史元素与其融为一体。
  - **The historical and community lives of Hanzheng Street region also should be kept.**
    第四、保存历史空间以外，还应保存汉正街片区的历史和社会生活延续性。
  - **To adopt the excellent protection planning fully and implement them.**
    第五、保护与开发过程中，应严格执行保护规划，充分应用优秀的保护方案。
5.2 Protection of the historical buildings: the development isn’t to follow blindly, but to take reference from the cases ---taking Jiji Dawang Temple Power Plant and Baltimore Power Plant as the examples

- Jiji Dawang Temple Power Plant (Electric Lights Factory )
  It was founded by Hankou Hydropower Station, an organization established by China. It was built in 1908, including a 5-storey office building and a 2-storey workshop.
as one of the important marks of the modern industry of Wuhan, Jiji Power Plant also was a sign for the earliest energy base and industrial civilization. The building is of its own characteristics, being complete, with good appearance and great space, which can be served as an exhibition or a museum, playing a historical supporting role for the neighboring environment.

However, this old power plant was demolished in 2004 when Hanzheng Street experienced the new demolishing and rebuilding, which was replaced by Jiji Electric Power commercial centre, only the name is reserved.
Case 2: Jiji Dawang Temple Power Plant

Similar case abroad:
- Barnes & Noble Bookstore (original Power Plant) in Baltimore
  an old original discarded Power Plant in Baltimore, after
  reformation, it becomes the landmark of the city to attract
  thousands of tourists every day.

Baltimore Power Plant Before and After Its Reformation
Case2:  Jiji Dawang Temple Power Plant

- only a power plant with a history of a century has attracted so many visitors, to drive the urban development. It can be seen that the huge attraction and economic driving force created by the culture and history shall not be ignored by any city.
Case2: Jiji Dawang Temple Power Plant

Comparison
Both of above two are power plants, one became one of the ordinary commercial malls nationally, to seek for the benefits; while the other became a rare industrial heritage bookstore, a paradise to spread the knowledge.

Lessons
In the utilization of historical building protection, the principle of stern protection shall be observed, to fully take the successful experience from home and abroad as well as to realize the functional conversion in combination with the indigenous features, so as to form the new urban attractive point.
5.3 Historical building protection under comprise -- a case of metro station on Jianghan Road

- **Jianghan Road station to be added**
  
  Wuhan No. 2 metro line is under construction. Considering the visitors flow rate and safety factors on Jianghan Road as well as the commercial benefits produced by the metro station, this station will be added.

- **Metro station adding lead to demolish old shops and a excellent historical building**
  
  Demolish area including 12 old buildings (some are old and famous shops, such as Jingyi Eyeglasses Store, Si Ji Mei soup buns, Xinhua Bookstore and Shenghuo Bookstore, etc) also an excellent historical building listed by protection in 2007 is involved, namely Zhou Xiehe Gold Shop.
If the decision of demolition have already determined, what compromise approach can be given?
Case 3: metro station on Jianghan Road

- **Recover the original appearance**
  
  We encourage to recover the original facade appearance, the stone material on the vertical face of the historical buildings should be marked one by one in order to recover it as original. Even the inside may be changed, the facade face should be treated well at least. But it needs more time, labor and material resources.

Life Bookstore (since 1938)  
Zhou Xiehe Gold Shop
Case 3: metro station on Jianghan Road

- Rebuild rendering
- Hearing for adding this station
Case 3: metro station on Jianghan Road

- excellent cases in Chicago of America

Another comprise between the protection and development

One is that there is a historical protection building on the former site, but a high building will be built due to development, so the former vertical face on the bottom can be pasted to that of the new building, whose effect is acceptable.

Protection of the facing on the bottom
Case3: metro station on Jianghan Road

- excellent cases in Chicago of America

Lessons
- protection of the original facing;
- protection of alternative tiles on the vertical face;
- protection of facing on the bottom;
- protection of vertical overlying compensation.

Interlude the tiles for the new and old building
Conclusion

- From the above cases and analysis, these historical cultural heritages demolition have been sealed off by history, I wish that their disappearance can wake up and strengthen the protection sense of the planning and decision-making, to realize the significance of protecting these old buildings for urban attraction.

- In conflict between preservation and redevelopment, remain the historic noumenon and carry out the protection planning is essential.

- For important marks historic building, absorb excellent rebuilding experiences (e.g. implement functional conversion) to form new landmark and attractiveness.

- Implement the protection measures mentioned above for Historical building preservation under comprise in the last link.

- The blind demolishing should be stopped. Cherish every existing historic building or district, any of them may be the next potential chance to form a new attractiveness of the city.
Thanks for Your attention!